I’d Rather Be Lucky
Than Good

Homogenized Milk
“The folklore of every company contains accounts of heroic decision makers, stalwarts who made crucial decisions under conditions of great uncertainty and were right. And they did this time and time again…. Admiring such heroic decision makers makes about as much sense as admiring the heroic pennies that come up heads in each of the twenty tries of the usual introductory probability theory example.”

- R. Richard Ritti, *The Ropes to Skip and the Ropes to Know*
The “Company”

- Ten percent Elites (make good decisions 90% of the time)

- Eighty percent Average Joes (67% good decisions)

- Ten percent Coin Flippers (50% good decisions)
The Rules

- A good decision yields a good result 67% of the time
- A bad decision yields a good result 33% of the time
- Three consecutive good results get an employee promoted into management
The Composition of the Management Team

Elites

Avg Joes

Coin Flippers

Good D => Good R 67%
Bad D => Good R 33%
3 Good R => Mgmt.

P90=25% 15% P10=6%
P90=89% 78% P10=67%
P90=15% 7% P10=0%
The Composition of the Management Team

- Elites Avg Joes Coin Flippers
- P90=33% 17% P10=0%
- 9% of the time, all of management is Average Joes!
- 17% of the time, NO Elites make it into management!
- Good D => Good R 67%
- Bad D => Good R 33%
- 4 Good R => Mgmt.
- P90=17% 6% P10=0%
The Composition of the Management Team

- Elites
  - P90=27%
  - P10=8%

- Avg Joes
  - P90=88%
  - P10=65%

- Coin Flippers
  - P90=13%
  - P10=0%

Good D => Good R 75%
Bad D => Good R 20%
3 Good R => Mgmt.
The Composition of the Management Team

- **Elites**
  - P90 = 36%
  - P10 = 8%

- **Avg Joes**
  - P90 = 90%
  - P10 = 58%

- **Coin Flippers**
  - P90 = 13%
  - P10 = 0%

- **Good D => Good R** 75%
- **Bad D => Good R** 20%
- **4 Good R => Mgmt.** 7%
- **NO Elites make it into management!** 7%
- **4% of the time, all of management is Average Joes!**

February 28th, 2002
Patrick Leach
DAAG Conference
But…

- Having 10% Elites, 80% Average Joes, etc. isn’t very realistic
- In reality, there should be a continuous distribution of ability across the “company”
- So….
The Quartile Model

- Re-model, using a uniform distribution of ability, ranging from 50% good decisions to 99.5% good decisions
- Keep track of what percent of the management team comes from each quartile
Management Composition by Quartile

- Top Quartile:
  - Good D => Good R 75%, Bad D => Good R 20% (38%)
  - Good D => Good R 67%, Bad D => Good R 33% (34%)

- 2nd Quartile:
  - 28%
  - 27%

- 3rd Quartile:
  - 20%
  - 22%

- Bottom Quartile:
  - 13%
  - 17%

10% of the time, the majority of management comes from the 3rd & bottom quartiles!
But…

- A uniform distribution of ability isn’t very realistic, either
- It’s probably near-normal, but slightly skewed to the right
- So…. 
Yet Another Tweak

- Re-model, using a lognormal distribution of ability, ranging from 50% good decisions to 99.5% good decisions, with a peak at about 70%
- Give each “employee” a percentile rank
- Make note of the average rank of employee to make it into management, as well as the highest and lowest ranked
Range of Percentile Ranks in Management

- 67/33, 3 Res.:
  - Percentile: 6th
  - Rank: 96th

- 67/33, 4 Res.:
  - Percentile: 11th
  - Rank: 94th

- 75/20, 3 Res.:
  - Percentile: 6th
  - Rank: 97th

- 75/20, 4 Res.:
  - Percentile: 12th
  - Rank: 96th
Notes and Caveats

- The model, however artificial, is remarkably robust
- The slightly-above-average shall inherit the company
- Management cross section ~ Company cross-section
Are Management Teams Representative of Those They Lead?

“It is essential [for management] to employ, trust, and reward those whose perspective, ability, and judgment are radically different from [theirs]. It is also rare, for it requires uncommon humility, tolerance, and wisdom.”

- Dee Hock
What Does It All Mean?

- Probably not much
- However, there are some points to take away:
  - In an uncertain world, it’s awfully hard to tell the lucky from the good
  - Intuitive decision making – even with a good track record – is perilous
  - Don’t believe your own hype
Two Final Thoughts

- "Unquestionably, such a thing a leadership does exist. We shouldn’t be dismayed if a good measure of it consists in getting out in front of the crowd and heading wherever they happen to be going."

- "Leaders do make a difference in the success of organizations. On the other hand, good fortune bears an uncanny resemblance to good judgment."

- R. Richard Ritti, *The Ropes to Skip and the Ropes to Know*